**Mila Before 8 days**

Rama yoreh deah siman 262 sif 1

If a baby had mila before 8 days , yotzeh

Taz sif katan 2

On the 8th day you don’t need to take more blood

Rama siman 264

Theres no difference if jew or non jew does mila for baby (that could have sakana at 8 days and on) before 8 days, bc its not called mila. Ber hagola explains the rama and says either jew or non jew can do the mila but if the jew did it, it works like the rama wrote in siman 262

But if non jew did it, you need to take more blood at 8 days

Aruch hashulchan (ot 10)

What does the rama mean when he says “there is no difference between jew or non jew before 8 days”?! we know there is a difference… if non jew does it you need to take more blood, if jew does it, you don’t…! that is regarding if u did it lishma… but if Jew or non jew does mila before 8 days bc of sakana, then you need to take more blood at 8 days

Minchas chinuch mitzvah 2 sif katan 22 “viheneh”

Mila Is on eighth day and before this there is no obligation to do Mila. Compares it to tashbisu - get rid of your chametz at the proper zman before pesach. If you did tashbisu before the correct zman, and therefore you didn’t have any chametz to get rid of at the correct zman for tashbisu, you didn’t fulfill mitzvah aseh of tashbisu. This is like someone who doesn’t wear a 4 cornered garment to put tzitzit on it. However if he got rid of chametz before the zman, he wasn’t mevatel mitzvas aseh of tashbisu. Therefore you should leave over some chametz to do tashbisu at the proper zman so that you can fulfill mitzvah aseh. Similar to someone who doesn’t wear a 4 cornered garment so that he doesn’t need to put tzitzit on them. - You shouldn’t do this. Jews should bring themselves to do mitzvos, and not find loop holes. So, if you did mila before eight days there is no issur, and can be done by those who are generally forbidden to do the mila (goy) , because the obligation is not present before 8 days. You didn’t fulfill the mitzvah of mila, and you also weren’t mivatel mitzvah, if mila is done before 8 days. And you don’t even need to take more blood at 8 days (similar to chametz) (but Hashem could possibly punish you at certain times for doing this, and its against Hashames will)

Shagat aryeh siman 52

A baby who needs mila before eight days bc of Health reasons… can it be done by those who are generally pasul to do it? If mila is done before eight days, do you need to take more blood at eight days? He quotes the shach in siman 262 that you need to take more blood at eight days… bc you weren’t yotzeh before eight days … (shachs proof - if you would say that mila works before 8 Days, then you should do mila before eighth day, if eighth day is shabbas. This is not the Halacha, so mila doesn’t work before eight days, therefore you need to take more blood at eight days) shagat aryeh asks question on shachs Proof. Why not just do mila after shabbas? Answer - that’s not a question, bc you shouldn’t Delay mitzvoth. He rejects shach and says that even if you are yotzeh before eight days, you should still do it on eighth day, which is shabbas, because that’s the proper time.

Shagat aryeh holds that if you do mila before 8 days you are not yotzeh at all, and taking more blood on 8th day doesn’t help. (you aready messed up, you cant fix it)

Whereas the shach holds mila before 8 days works, but you need to take more blood on 8th day to beutify it bc before 8 days wasn’t min hamuvchar.

Shagat aryeh says that doing mila before 8 days is not possible bc you’re not yotzeh, therefore you need to wait for 8th day. Therefore mila pushes off shabbas, bc you can’t do it before 8th day (shabbas)

Some achronim say that you are yotzeh before 8 days and don’t need to take more blood on 8th day.

However, acc to shagat aryeh you weren’t yotzeh, and you cannot fix it with drawing more blood on 8th day.

Footnote 142 on shagat aryeh called kuntris achron murchuv

The rama that says, mila before 8 days you’re not yotzeh – meaning that you weren’t yotzeh during those 8 days but once 8th day comes, retroactively you’re yotzeh.

See slach in pesachim 72

As we know mila has 2 aspects to it … hu sheyanimul and maseh mila

If mila was done before 8 days, you wernt mikayim maseh mila, but on 8th day you will fulfill hu sheyanimul bc the mila was done during the day so retroactively you fulfill hu sheyanimul.

Shagat aryeh concludes – he says if you need to do mila before 8 days bc a baby is sick, then even a non jew can do the mila bc either way you’re not fulfilling anything when you do mila early.... and drawing more blood doesn’t help either. Acc to those who say that you are yotzeh mila before 8 days but you still gotta draw more blood, they will hold that mila done before 8 days can only be done by someone who is allowed. (ie non jew cannot do it)

Otzer habrit and sefer habrit

Bottom line – if mila was done before 8th day you should take more blood on 8th day to cover all opinions

Thank you Rafi Thalheim for writing this after many chavrusa sessions with me.